



CLSF Latvijas Cilvēktiesību komiteja
F.I.D.H. Latvian Human Rights Committee

Латвийский комитет по правам человека (МФПЧ)

Reg. No. 40008010632, address: 102a-15, Dzirnavu Str. Riga, LV1050, Latvia. Phone
+371 26420477 www.lhrc.lv e-mail: lhrc@lhrc.lv

September 14, 2018

a submission for working session 8 of the
Human Dimension Implementation Meeting

Minority education attacked in Latvia: 2018 amendments to education laws

Contents

Current situation and the essence of amendments	2
The story of the current amendments	3
Violating Latvia's obligations.....	4
International concerns and reaction of authorities	4
Annex. Comparative texts of the amendments to education laws	6
P.S. Other current language-related issues	10
Recommendations for Latvia	11

Current situation and the essence of amendments

As at end-2017, the Education Law had allowed free choice of language of instruction for private schools and for grades 1 to 6 of public schools. For public high schools (grades 10 to 12) it was allowed to teach up to 40 % of the curriculum in a minority language. In grades 7 to 9, public schools were allowed to use one of government-proposed models (by grade 9, those do not allow more than 40 % in a minority language alone, but some allow more if including also lessons taught bilingually) or to choose their own model, the latter having the same restrictions as high schools.

The main topic of the present text is the pack of amendments to the Education Law, adopted in March 2018. They aim to abolish remaining instruction in minority languages in high schools, by 2019-2021. Besides, it provides for instruction in grades 1-6 to have at least 50 % of the curriculum taught in Latvian and for grades 7-9 - at least 80 %. It will apply for private schools, too.

Exceptions are foreseen for schools acting under international treaties or integrating curriculum with teaching EU official languages. The wording excludes languages of most minorities in Latvia: speakers of Russian, Belarusian, Ukrainian.

For the context: as at 2011, over 37 % of the population of Latvia speak Russian at home.¹ As at 2016/2017, approximately 56,000 pupils learned in Russian, approximately 1000 in Polish and 1000 in other languages (all numbers include bilingual education).²

Besides, in June 2018, the parliament has amended the Law on Institutions of Higher Education, depriving private colleges and universities of the right to teach in non-EU-official languages and limiting their rights to use EU official languages other than Latvian.³ This concerns approximately a half of students of private institutions of higher education, those who study in Russian, English or multilingually⁴ – since January, 2019, no new students will be accepted to Russian-language programmes besides philology.

The current amendments are new steps in a long line of regressive measures:

- 1992: the new version of the Languages Law⁵ limits the possibility of instruction in Russian in state-founded institutions of higher education (universities etc.) to the freshmen – first academic year.
- 1998: the new Education Law⁶ has abolished it at all (except Russian philology). The same Education Law, in its initial version, had provided

1 <https://www.csb.gov.lv/en/statistics/statistics-by-theme/population/census/search-in-theme/1442-home-latvian-spoken-62-latvian-population>

2 http://www.izm.gov.lv/images/statistika/izglitiba/2016_2017/Vs_apmac_val_skoleni.xlsx (LV)

3 <http://www.baltic-course.com/eng/education/?doc=141364>

4 http://www.izm.gov.lv/images/izglitiba_augst/Parskats-par-Latvijas-augstako-izglitibu-2017gada.pdf (LV) p. 70

5 <http://www.vvk.lv/index.php?sadala=135&id=165> See Section 11 (LV)

for instruction in Latvian only in public high schools of national minorities, starting from 2004. After the biggest⁷ peaceful protests in the history of the newly independent Latvia, these provisions had been softened in 2004, see the current situation described above).

- 2014: Cabinet regulations⁸ impose the same requirement to teach in Latvian at least 60 % of the curriculum on grades 7 to 9 of public high schools of national minorities (with some flexibility).

The story of the current amendments

On October 6, 2017, the education minister has announced, without consulting the minorities affected, his intention to switch public high schools to Latvian only, except the minorities' own languages and ethno-cultural subjects. The minister's presentation includes a reference to 2016 amendments introducing vague loyalty requirements for teachers, with a threat of removal⁹.

On October, 9, the ruling coalition has supported the proposal,¹⁰ although before, the Prime Minister said on the languages in education, "we adopt a gradual transition concerning state exams, and other issues are not on the agenda"¹¹. On November, 10, the minister has presented a report¹² on the reform, which included private high schools and grades 7 to 9 as well.¹³

The Advisory Council on Minority Education under the education ministry was said by its chairman and by the Parliament chairwoman¹⁴ to have supported, "conceptually", the minister. In light of invoked loyalty provisions and the council mostly consisting of ministry-dependent educators, this could seem realistic. However, even state-run LSM.lv media outlet admits that a vote did not take place in the council.¹⁵

6 <https://likumi.lv/doc.php?id=50759> (LV; a partially-outdated English translation is available at http://www.vvc.gov.lv/export/sites/default/docs/LRTA/Likumi/Education_Law.doc The most relevant Section 9 is basically up-to-date in the translation)

7 <http://www.refworld.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/rwmain?page=search&docid=473c550523>

8 Regulations No. 468 of 12.08.2014 <https://likumi.lv//ta/id/268342> See annex No. 25 (LV)

9

http://www.izm.gov.lv/images/aktualitates/2017/Par_latviesu_valodas_stiprinasanu_vispareja_izglitiba.pdf (LV)

10 <http://rus.delfi.lv/news/daily/latvia/koaliciya-podderzhala-postepennyj-perehod-na-obrazovanie-na-latyshskom-yazyke.d?id=49319733> (RU) <http://www.delfi.lv/news/national/politics/koalicija-atbalsta-pakapenisku-pareju-uz-izglitiba-latviesu-valoda.d?id=49319327> (LV)

11 <http://apollo.tvnet.lv/zinas/nacionala-apvieniba-varetu-rosinat-pareju-uz-macibu-procesu-tikai-valsts-valoda/807121> (LV)

12 <http://www.izm.gov.lv/lv/sabiedribas-lidzdaliba/sabiedriskajai-apsprisanai-nodotie-normativo-aktu-projekti/2667-informativais-zinojums-par-pareju-uz-macibam-valsts-valoda-visparejas-izglitibas-iestades> Links to the report and its annex (LV)

13 http://www.izm.gov.lv/images/izglitiba_visp/IZMZino_091117_latviesu_valoda.pdf Report (LV), see p. 6

14 <http://www.saeima.lv/en/news/saeima-news/26346-address-by-inara-murniece-speaker-of-the-12th-saeima-at-the-celebratory-saeima-sitting-in-honour-of-the-99th-anniversary-of-the-proclamation-of-independence-of-the-republic-of-latvia-on-18-november-2017>

15 <http://rus.lsm.lv/statja/analitika/analitika/ministra-shadurskisa-uprekayut-v-vidache-zhelaemogozadeystvitelnoe-pri-obsuzhdenii-shkol-nacmeshinstv.a257742/> (RU)

In January, 2018, the draft amendments were adopted by the Cabinet, in a harsher version also covering grades 1 to 6 (at least 50 % of the curriculum to be taught in Latvian). On March 22, the amendments have been adopted by the parliament in the final, third reading, in an essentially identical version.

Numerous peaceful mass protests against the reform have been met with police pressure, including ongoing criminal proceedings¹⁶ involving a detention¹⁷. The detention¹⁸ and a refusal to allow a rally¹⁹ were later recognized by courts to be unlawful.

Violating Latvia's obligations

The amendments violate Articles 12-14 of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (hereinafter Framework Convention). Even the milder "reform" of 2004 was criticized by its Advisory Committee: "Committee regrets the fact that [...] more restrictive language conditions have been placed on the education provided for minorities. In particular, a new provision was introduced in the 2004-2005 school year making it compulsory to teach a minimum 60% of the public secondary school curricula for national minorities in Latvian".²⁰

The amendments are also contrary to the best interests of the minority children, violating Articles 2, 3, 28-30 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Convention against Discrimination in Education. This is confirmed by the near-universal recognition of the benefits of education in mother tongue. See, e.g., OSCE Hague recommendations²¹ and UNESCO documents:^{22 23 24}.

A case has been initiated before the Constitutional Court by the opposition MPs who contest the constitutionality of the Education Law amendments of March 2018.²⁵

International concerns and reaction of authorities

16 <http://www.dp.gov.lv/lv/noderigi/publikacijas/par-kriminalprocesa-uzsaksanu.art103> (LV)

17 <http://www.dp.gov.lv/lv/noderigi/publikacijas/par-personas-aizturesanu.art104> (LV)

18 <https://rus.lsm.lv/statja/novosti/proisshestvija/prorossiyskiy-aktivist-linderman-vipuschen-iz-pod-strazhi.a279164/> (RU)

19 <http://reitingi.lv/ru/news/sabiedriba/98337-sud-razresil-provesti-miting-v-zasitu-russkih-skol-v-daugavpils.html> (RU)

20 Para. 138 <https://rm.coe.int/168008be5a>

21 Paras. 11-13, at <http://www.osce.org/hcnm/32180?download=true>

22 Principle I in Part III, at <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0012/001297/129728e.pdf>

23 Para. 32 on page 37 <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0024/002456/245656E.pdf>

24 Para. 3 of the "Key Messages" <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0024/002437/243713E.pdf>

25 <http://www.satv.tiesa.gov.lv/en/press-release/a-case-initiated-with-respect-norms-that-define-the-language-of-instruction-in-education/>

In February 2018, the Advisory Committee of the Framework Convention has adopted its opinion on Latvia, expected to include comments on the initial text of the amendments. The foreign ministry of Latvia is delaying its publication, as at September.²⁶ Notably, a former Committee's chairman has criticized the current "reform".²⁷

Besides, in January 2018, three UN Special Rapporteurs have expressed "serious concern" over the education reform and requested additional information.²⁸

The foreign ministry has delayed the response²⁹, only answering in March, after the adoption of the amendments. The answer is misleading. The foreign ministry ignores some documents referred to by the Special Rapporteurs, including the Hague recommendations. Besides, it claims that "Latvia will continue to support state-funded minority education programmes in seven minority languages: Russian, Polish, Belarusian, Ukrainian, Estonian, Lithuanian and Hebrew". In fact, most recent statistical data by the education ministry do not mention anybody learning in Estonian, Lithuanian and Hebrew.³⁰ The latter is more realistic, as learning in these languages is virtually limited to learning the languages themselves, not other subjects. The use of Belarusian and Ukrainian is very limited, too, according to unofficial information (the ministry does not provide specific data). Moreover, the ministry claims support to the reform by the Advisory Council on Minority Education Issues and school principals. As shown above, this support is questionable. Finally, the ministry mentions some minority NGOs participating in discussing the reform, omitting that their language-related proposals were rejected.

In August, 2018, the UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination has expressed concern over the amendments and recommended to reconsider their necessity.³¹

26 <https://www.coe.int/en/web/minorities/latvia>

27 <http://www.dw.com/ru/без-русских-школ-что-не-так-с-новым-законом-об-образовании-латвии/a-43324786> (RU)

28 <https://spcommreports.ohchr.org/TMResultsBase/DownloadPublicCommunicationFile?gId=23588>
OL LVA 1/2018

29 <https://spcommreports.ohchr.org/TMResultsBase/DownloadFile?gId=79364>

30 http://www.izm.gov.lv/images/statistika/izglitiba/2016_2017/V5_apmac_val_skoleni.xlsx (LV)

31 CERD/C/LVA/CO/6-12

https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CERD/Shared%20Documents/LVA/CERD_C_LVA_CO_6-12_32235_E.pdf paras. 16-17

Annex. Comparative texts of the amendments to education laws

<p>The previous Education Law version</p> <p>(excerpts; translation based on the official one³²)</p>	<p>The amendments of March 2018</p> <p>(our unofficial, partial translation. Official text is in Latvian only³³)</p>
<p>Section 9. Language of Acquisition of Education</p> <p>(1) Education shall be acquired in the official language in education institutions belonging to the State, local government and state-owned institutions of higher education.</p> <p>(2) Education may be acquired in another language:</p> <p>1) in private educational institutions;</p> <p>2) in State and local government educational institutions in which educational programmes for ethnic minorities are implemented in conformity with the provisions of Section 41 of this Law;</p> <p>3) in educational institutions specified in other laws.</p> <p>[..]</p> <p>.</p>	<p>1. In the Section 9:</p> <p>To supplement the section with Paragraph 1.¹ reading as follows:</p> <p>“(1¹) In private educational institutions, general education and professional education, on the basic and secondary educational levels, shall be acquired in the official language”;</p> <p>To amend Clauses 1 and 2 of Paragraph 2 to read as follows:</p> <p>“1) in educational institutions in which educational programmes are implemented in accordance with bilateral or multilateral international treaties of the Republic of Latvia ;</p> <p>2) in educational institutions in which educational programmes for ethnic minorities are implemented on pre-school educational level and basic educational level, in conformity with the provisions of Section 41 of this Law”;</p> <p>To supplement Paragraph 2 with Clause 2.¹ reading as follows:</p> <p>“2¹) in educational institutions in which study subjects of general education programmes are fully or partly implemented in a foreign language, in order to ensure acquisition of other official languages of the European</p>

32 http://www.vvc.gov.lv/export/sites/default/docs/LRTA/Likumi/Education_Law.doc

33 <https://likumi.lv/ta/id/298097-grozijumi-izglitibas-likuma> (LV)

	Union, in conformity with the conditions of respective State educational standards”;
<p>Section 41. Educational Programmes for Ethnic Minorities</p> <p>(1) Educational programmes for ethnic minorities shall be drawn up by an educational institution selecting any of the model educational programmes included in the guidelines for the State pre-school education or in the respective State educational standards.</p> <p>(2) Educational programmes for ethnic minorities shall include content necessary for acquisition of the relevant ethnic culture and for integration of ethnic minorities in Latvia.</p>	<p>3. In the Section 41:</p> <p>To replace in Paragraph 1 the words “respective State educational standards” with the words “State basic education standard”;</p> <p>To supplement the Section with Paragraphs 1.¹ and 1.² reading as follows:</p> <p>“(1¹) in the educational programmes for ethnic minorities from grade 1 to grade 6 the acquisition of the content of studies in the official language shall be ensured for not less than 50 per cent of the total teaching hour load in the academic year, including foreign languages.</p> <p>(1²) in the educational programmes for ethnic minorities from grade 7 to grade 9 the acquisition of the content of studies in the official language shall be ensured for not less than 80 per cent of the total teaching hour load in the academic year, including foreign languages.”</p>
<p>Transitional Provisions [..]</p> <p>9. Section 9, Paragraph one and Paragraph two, Clause 2 of this Law shall come into force progressively:[..]; and</p> <p>3) on 1 September 2004 – in State and local government general secondary educational institutions, which implement minority educational programmes, commencing in the tenth grade, studies shall take place in the official language in conformity with the State general secondary education standard; in State and local government professional educational institutions commencing in</p>	<p>7. In the Transitional Provisions: to abolish the second sentence of Subclause 3 of Clause 9.</p>

the first academic year shall take place in the official language in conformity with the State professional standard or the State professional secondary education standard. The State general secondary education standard, the State professional standard and the State professional secondary education standard shall specify that the acquisition of the content of studies in the official language shall be ensured for not less than three-fifths of the total teaching hour load in the academic year, including foreign languages, and shall ensure with the minority language, the acquisition of identity and culture associated studies content in the minority language.

7. In the Transitional Provisions [...] to add Clauses 66, 67 [...] reading as follows:

“66. The amendments to Section 9 of this law concerning supplementing the section with Paragraph 1.¹ and revising Clause 2 of Paragraph 2, and the amendments to Paragraph 1 of Section 41 of this law concerning replacing the words “respective State educational standards” with the words “State basic education standard” and supplementing the section with Paragraph 1.¹ and 1.² shall come into force:

66.1. on 1 September 2019 – in respect of implementing pre-school educational programmes and implementing basic education programmes in grades 1 to 7;

66.2. on 1 September 2020 – in respect of implementing basic education programmes in grade 8 and implementing secondary education programmes in grades 10 and 11;

	<p>66.3. on 1 September 2021 – in respect of implementing basic education programmes in grade 9 and implementing secondary education programmes in grade 12.</p> <p>67. The amendments to Clause 9 of the Transitional Provisions of this law, abolishing its second sentence, shall come into force:</p> <p>67.1. on 1 September 2020 – in respect of implementing secondary education programmes in grades 10 and 11;</p> <p>67.2. on 1 September 2021 – in respect of implementing secondary education programmes in grade 12.</p>
--	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

<p>The previous version of the Paragraph 3 of Section 56 of the Law On Institutions of Higher Education (governmental translation³⁴; our highlighting added - LHRC)</p>	<p>The version as amended in June 2018 (in force since January 2019; our highlighting added - LHRC)</p>
<p>(3) The study programmes of State-founded institutions of higher education shall be implemented in the official language. The use of foreign languages in the implementation of study programmes shall be possible only in the following cases:</p> <p>1) study programmes which are acquired by foreign students in Latvia, and study programmes, which are implemented within the scope of co-operation provided for in European Union programmes and international agreements may be implemented in the official languages of the European Union. For foreign students the</p>	<p>(3) The study programmes of institutions of higher education and colleges shall be implemented in the official language. The use of foreign languages in the implementation of study programmes shall be possible only in the following cases:</p> <p>1) study programmes which are acquired by foreign students in Latvia, and study programmes, which are implemented within the scope of co-operation provided for in European Union programmes and international agreements may be implemented in the official languages of the European Union. For foreign students the</p>

³⁴ <https://likumi.lv/ta/en/en/id/37967-law-on-institutions-of-higher-education>

<p>acquisition of the official language shall be included in the study course compulsory amount if studies in Latvia are expected to be longer than six months or exceed 20 credit points;</p> <p>2) not more than one-fifth of the credit point amount of a study programme may be implemented in the official languages of the European Union, taking into account that in this part final and State examinations may not be included, as well as the writing of qualification, bachelor and master's thesis;</p> <p>3) study programmes, which are implemented in foreign languages are necessary for the achievement of the aims of the study programme in conformity with the educational classification of the Republic of Latvia for such educational programme groups: language and cultural studies and language programmes. The licensing commission shall decide the conformity of the study programme to the educational programme group; and</p> <p>4) joint study programmes may be implemented in the official languages of the European Union.</p>	<p>acquisition of the official language shall be included in the study course compulsory amount if studies in Latvia are expected to be longer than six months or exceed 20 credit points;</p> <p>2) not more than one-fifth of the credit point amount of a study programme may be implemented in the official languages of the European Union, taking into account that in this part final and State examinations may not be included, as well as the writing of qualification, bachelor and master's thesis;</p> <p>3) study programmes, which are implemented in foreign languages are necessary for the achievement of the aims of the study programme in conformity with the educational classification of the Republic of Latvia for such educational programme groups: language and cultural studies and language programmes. The licensing commission shall decide the conformity of the study programme to the educational programme group; and</p> <p>4) joint study programmes may be implemented in the official languages of the European Union.</p>
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Compiled by Aleksandr Kuzmin LL.M., LHRC secretary-executive

P.S. Other current language-related issues

The following draft laws, dangerous for minority rights, are now under consideration in the parliament of Latvia:

No. 1280/Lp12 Amendments to the Electronic Mass Media Law (*Grozījumi Elektronisko plašsaziņas līdzekļu likumā*) Sent to the commissions (pre-readings) on 07.06.2018. The bill mandates radio stations to have at least 20 % of phonograms and music recordings in Latvian and/or created in Latvia in the last 36 months.

No. 1250/Lp12 Amendments to the Electronic Mass Media Law (*Grozījumi Elektronisko plašsaziņas līdzekļu likumā*) Sent to the commissions (pre-readings) on 03.05.2018. The bill mandates basic TV packages to have at least 90 % of content in EU official languages - thus excluding Russian, the language of 37 % of the population, according to 2011 census

No. 901/Lp12 Amendments to the Latvian Administrative Violations Code (*Grozījumi Latvijas Administratīvo pārkāpumu kodeksā*) by the co-ruling National Alliance. Adopted in the 1st reading (of three) on 14.09.2017. The bill:

- will raise the fines for violating linguistic legislation up to 100 times (for the most widespread violation, the growth is slower),
- introduce dismissal of state officials (including municipal councilors and mayors) for some of the violations, and
- create a new victimless offence - sending bilingual catalogues, bulletins etc. to people without their request. Both private persons and public officials are intended to be punished.

No. 1167/Lp12 Amendments to the Labour Law (*Grozījumi Darba likumā*) by the co-ruling National Alliance. Adopted in the 1st reading (of three) on 06.09.2018. The bill:

- 1) prohibits private sector employers to require skills in a non-Latvian language, unless the requirement is "objective and justified" and explicitly provided for in one's job description.
- 2) prohibits public sector employers to require in a language not official in the EU - unless specifically allowed to do so by the Cabinet.

Crucially, communicating with local customers will not be a justification for asking for skills in Russian, even in Riga and Daugavpils, where Russian is the family language of most residents. The bill is being presented as an anti-discrimination measure - allegedly those unable to speak Russian are discriminated against in the labour market. In a telling way, excessive requirements for Latvian language skills are not seen as discriminatory by the authors.

No. 1166/Lp12 Amendments to the Latvian Administrative Violations Code (*Grozījumi Latvijas Administratīvo pārkāpumu kodeksā*) by the co-ruling National Alliance. Sent to the commissions (pre-readings) on 08.03.2018. The bill establishes fines for not using Latvian in election campaigning, up to EUR 700 for natural persons and up to EUR 5000 for legal persons.

Recommendations:

For OSCE participating states:

- To use the existing OSCE human dimension mechanisms to promote implementation of the OSCE Copenhagen Document and Hague recommendations in Latvia;

For OSCE institutions:

- To conduct a fact-finding mission to Latvia, with participation of the Office of the High Commissioner on National Minorities and with a view to express recommendations;

For Latvia:

- To withdraw the language-related amendments of 2018 to the Education Law and to the Law On Institutions of Higher Education;
- Should some of the Education Law amendments mentioned above remain on the books for now, to invite UN, OSCE, UNESCO and Council of Europe experts to express their opinion in the Constitutional Court case on the issue;
- To accept the longstanding country visit request from the UN Special Rapporteur on minority issues, in line with the standing invitation issued by Latvia for the UN Special Procedures;
- To abolish statutory preferences given to the EU official languages in education laws, by applying the same flexibility to other languages as well;
- To make a declaration allowing the UN Committee on Elimination of Racial Discrimination to consider individual complaints;
- To ratify the additional protocol to the UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education and the protocol No. 12 to the European Convention on Human Rights;
- To train sufficient numbers of teachers and prepare sufficient range of textbooks for bilingual education;
- To distinguish Latvian language exam requirements for graduates of minority schools and Latvian-language-only schools;
- To stop the policy of disproportional closure and downgrading of minority schools;
- To restore the option of using Russian language in school graduation exams and statewide inter-school competitions;
- To reject the bills Nos. 901/Lp12, 1166/Lp12 and 1167/Lp12 and the language-related provisions of the bills Nos. 1250/Lp12 and 1280/Lp12;
- To make the OSCE Hague recommendations the basis for the language policy in education.